



**X: Inactive (missed last 3 meetings in a row)**  
**Inactive Membership is automatically re-instated by attending a meeting**

**SBCCOG BOARD MEETINGS: ATTENDANCE 2020 - 2021**

City	June - 20	July – 20	Aug - 20	Sep - 20	Oct – 20	Nov-20	Jan - 21
<b>Carson</b>	Hicks	Hicks	Hicks	Hicks	Hicks	Hicks	
<b>El Segundo</b>	Boyles	Boyles		Boyles	Boyles	Boyles	
<b>Gardena</b>	Tanaka	Tanaka Francis	Tanaka	Tanaka		Tanaka	
<b>Hawthorne</b>	Valentine	Valentine	Valentine	Valentine	Valentine	Valentine	
<b>Hermosa Beach</b>	Armato	Armato	Armato	Armato Massey	Armato	Armato	
<b>Inglewood</b>	Franklin Butts	Franklin Butts	Franklin Butts	Franklin	Franklin	Franklin	
<b>Lawndale</b>			Suarez	Suarez	Suarez	Suarez	
<b>Lomita</b>	Gazeley	Gazeley Waronek		Gazeley	Gazeley		
<b>Los Angeles</b>	Buscaino		Buscaino				<b>X</b>
<b>Manhattan Beach</b>	Stern	Stern	Stern	Stern	Stern	Stern	
<b>Palos Verdes Estates</b>	Kao	Kao	Kao	Kao	Kao	Kao	
<b>Rancho Palos Verdes</b>	Cruikshank	Cruikshank	Cruikshank	Cruikshank	Cruikshank	Cruikshank	
<b>Redondo Beach</b>	Horvath Emdee	Horvath	Horvath	Horvath	Horvath	Horvath	
<b>Rolling Hills</b>	Dieringer	Dieringer	Dieringer			Dieringer	
<b>Rolling Hills Estates</b>	Huff	Huff	Huff	Huff	Huff	Huff Mitchell	
<b>Torrance</b>	Chen	Chen	Chen	Chen	Chen	Chen	
<b>County of Los Angeles-2<sup>nd</sup> District</b>				<b>X</b>	<b>X</b>	<b>X</b>	<b>X</b>
<b>County of Los Angeles- 4<sup>th</sup> District</b>	LaMarque	LaMarque			LaMarque		

<b>Number of Active Agencies</b>	<b>17</b>	<b>17</b>	<b>17</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>Quorum Required (50% +1)</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>Number of Agencies Attending</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>15</b>	<b>14</b>	<b>14</b>	<b>14</b>	<b>14</b>	<b>14</b>

**SOUTH BAY CITIES COUNCIL OF GOVERNMENTS  
THURSDAY, NOVEMBER 19, 2020  
HELD VIRTUALLY VIA ZOOM**

**I. CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Valentine called the SBCCOG Board of Directors meeting to order at 6:00 pm.

**II. VERIFY QUORUM**

**In attendance were the following voting elected officials:**

Cedric Hicks, Carson	Kenny Kao, Palos Verdes Estates
Drew Boyles, El Segundo	John Cruikshank, Rancho Palos Verdes (7pm departure)
Rodney Tanaka, Gardena	Christian Horvath, Redondo Beach
Olivia Valentine, Hawthorne	Bea Dieringer, Rolling Hills
Stacey Armato, Hermosa Beach	Britt Huff, Rolling Hills Estates
Ralph Franklin, Inglewood	George Chen, Torrance
Bernadette Suarez, Lawndale	
Hildy Stern, Manhattan Beach	

**Other elected officials in attendance:**

Hany Fangary, Hermosa Beach	Judy Mitchell, Rolling Hills Estates
-----------------------------	--------------------------------------

**Also, in attendance were the following persons:**

Brianne Cohen, Torrance	Colleen Farrell, SBCCOG
Shin Furukawa, Torrance	Grace Farwell, SBCCOG
Stephano Padilla, AQMD	Laurie Jacobs, SBCCOG
Diana Coronado, BIA	Vibha Joshi, SBESC Volunteer
Jeff Kiernan, Cal Cities	Kathy Young, SBESC Volunteer
Stephen Sawyer, Charter/Spectrum	Patricia Macias, SBESC Volunteer
Gina Goodhill, Clean Power Alliance	Grace Peng, SBESC Volunteer
Henry Rogers, Pear Strategies	Karen Kanda, SBESC Volunteer
Joshua Torres, SCE	Stu Woodward, SBESC Volunteer
Michael Huynh, SCE	Daryll Strauss, SBESC Volunteer
Faviola Ochoa, SoCalGas	Jacob Hall, SBESC Volunteer
Frank Lopez, SoCalGas	Colette Portela, SBESC Volunteer
Mike Harriel, SoCalGas	Jon Rodman, SBESC Volunteer
Denise Campos, SoCalGas	Bichson Nguyen, SBESC Volunteer
Jacki Bacharach, SBCCOG	Daniel Bianca, SBESC Volunteer
Kim Fuentes, SBCCOG	Christopher Maloney, Public
Steve Lantz, SBCCOG	Holly Osborne, Public
Wally Siembab, SBCCOG	James Hannon, Public
David Leger, SBCCOG	Gail Shiimoto-Lohr, Public/City of Mission Viejo
Natalie Champion, SBCCOG	Erin Ramsey, Public

**III. CONFIRM POSTING OF THE AGENDA BY THE CITY OF TORRANCE**

Jacki Bacharach confirmed that the agenda was properly posted in the City of Torrance.

**IV. ANNOUNCEMENTS OF ANY CHANGES TO THE AGENDA**

Ms. Bacharach requested that the Board add discussion and action on a letter to SCAG to Item X of the agenda. The letter would urge SCAG to convene a closed session of the Regional Council to discuss recommendations of the SCAG RHNA Litigation Committee.

**MOTION** by Board Member Horvath, seconded by Board Member Hicks, to **ADD** consideration of the letter to SCAG to the agenda. No objection. So ordered. (Board Member Armato was not present for the vote).

**V. PUBLIC COMMENT**

Public comment was received on item VII-C and item X.

## **VI. CONSENT CALENDAR**

- A. October Board Meeting Minutes** (*attachments*) – **Approved**
- B. Additional Subregional Transportation Funds for the Torrance Transit Park & Ride Terminal Project** (*attachment*) – **Approved**
- C. Extension of PATH Contract** (*attachment*) – **Approved**
- D. Contract with Siembab Corporation** (*attachment*) – **Approved**
- E. SBCCOG Project List Submittal to SCAG for REAP funding** (*attachment*) – **Approved**
- F. Actions of Steering Committee since last Board meeting** (*attachment*) – **Received and Filed**
- G. Monthly Reports – Received and Filed**
  - 1. South Bay Environmental Services Center Report** (*attachment*)
  - 2. Transportation Report** (*attachment*)
  - 3. Reports from Outside Agencies** (*attachments for each at end of the agenda*)
    - a. League of California Cities & LA Division Legislative Committee (Bea Dieringer & Jeffrey Kiernan)
    - b. SCAG Regional Council (Drew Boles, Mark Henderson, James Gazeley)
    - c. SCAG Energy and Environment (Britt Huff)
    - d. South Bay Association of Chambers of Commerce (Olivia Valentine)
    - e. KHHR (Hawthorne Airport) Committee re: Community Impacts (Olivia Valentine)

**MOTION** by Board Member Huff, seconded by Board Member Franklin, to **APPROVE** the Consent Calendar. No objection. So ordered.

## **VII. PRESENTATIONS**

- A. Recognition and thank you to SBESC Volunteers**

The SBCCOG Board of Directors thanked SBESC Volunteers for their service to the organization. A short video was shared. A small thank you gift was mailed to each of the volunteers.
- B. Recognition and thank you to Former SBCCOG Chairs**

The Board Members thanked former SBCCOG Chairs Judy Mitchell, Ralph Franklin, and Jim Osborne for their service to the SBCCOG. Board Members Mitchell and Franklin shared some thoughts and expressed their gratitude for what the organization has accomplished and continues to do. Board Member Suarez announced that Councilmember Osborne was unable to attend the meeting, but sincerely thanked the SBCCOG.
- C. Southern California Gas Balanced Energy Resolution**

Supporters and opponents of the balanced energy resolution made their presentations.

Speaking in support of the resolution Mr. Rogers and Ms. Ochoa explained that adopting the resolution will express the SBCCOG's support for a technology and source neutral, local control approach for California energy sources. There are concerns that statewide mandates to electrify will lead to increased costs, lead to power shortages, and could create significant problems during power outages and/or grid disruptions. Ms. Ochoa added that SoCalGas supports efforts to reduce GHG emissions but feels that these changes should happen on the local level.

Mr. Torres spoke in opposition to the resolution. He explained that the goal of the resolution is to further support for natural gas and work against a clean energy future. He added that the supporters often argue that state goals will force individuals to upgrade existing gas infrastructure, which is untrue. State mandates and accompanying programs offer incentives to individuals, businesses, and municipalities to adopt cleaner electric energy. Environmental groups such as the Sierra Club have come out in opposition to the resolution. Resolutions such as these have been used to fight electric incentives.

Board Member Kao asked why the resolution was needed. Ms. Ochoa explained that it would allow SBCCOG staff to quickly submit position letters on the topic as the Board will have expressed their support for a balanced energy approach.

Board Member Horvath shared that he has concerns over language being used to argue local control to garner support for the resolution. Local control is not being lost and nobody is being forced to replace their gas-powered appliances. He added that goal deadlines of 2045 provide energy companies over 25 years to

meet carbon-neutral status. He recommended the SBCCOG take no position and allow each city to individually choose to support or oppose the resolution.

**MOTION** by Board Member Horvath, seconded by Board Member Stern, to take **NO POSITION** on the balanced energy resolution.

Board Member Suarez expressed her view that there was no harm in supporting the resolution, noting that it does not require continued use of gas.

Board Member Stern shared that she feels it is an active effort by gas companies to keep gas relevant. Manhattan Beach considered adopting the resolution, but found it to be contradictory to their policies, and did not ultimately vote to support the resolution. She expressed her support for the motion on the table that continues to allow each city to decide their own position.

Public comments were received from the following individuals:

Diana Coronado of the Building Industry Association of Southern California expressed their support for the resolution. It ensures choice and reliability, and they urge the Board to support the resolution.

Gina Goodhill of the Clean Power Alliance urged the Board to not support the resolution and expressed the view that it is being used by Sacramento to advocate against electrification efforts. The argument about choice creates a false equivalency and untrue trade-offs.

Grace Peng of the League of Women Voters (Beach Cities) urged the Board to not support the resolution. Electrification of new homes is “low hanging fruit” in terms of green building construction. Continuing electrification incentives will help those homeowners who wish to replace their gas appliances with electric ones.

Erin Ramsey also urged the Board to vote against the resolution noting it doesn’t protect consumer choice but limits them to old energy sources.

Hearing no more public comment, Chair Valentine called for a vote on the motion to **take no position** on the resolution.

**Ayes:** Hicks, Boyles, Tanaka, Armato, Stern, Kao, Horvath, Huff  
**Nays:** Valentine, Franklin, Suarez, Dieringer, Chen  
**Abstentions:** none

Motion to take no position passes. So ordered.

## **VIII. TRANSPORTATION REPORTS**

### **A. Metro Report**

Mr. Lantz reported the following items: Metro continues to experience significant revenue shortfalls, although revenue was higher than initially expected; Metro is looking into ways to reduce construction costs; Metro will be considering new revenue sources for their operations, which may include local return or subregional programs.

### **B. Transportation Committee report**

Board Member Horvath announced that the meeting went very quickly and that there was not much to report. Mr. Lantz added that SBCCOG staff is working with city staff to look into project funding shortfalls for current Measure R/M projects and requests for new projects as part of the annual Metro Budget Request process.

## **IX. SBCCOG PROGRAM ACTION ITEMS, REPORTS AND UPDATES**

### **A. Consultant Contract for General Assembly logistics (*handout*) – APPROVED**

Ms. Bacharach announced that the General Assembly will be held virtually and that SBCCOG staff requires technical assistance to put the large event on. An RFP was issued and staff is recommending Verdical Group. The proposal includes a base set of services, including a list of optional additional services. Ms. Fuentes

added that in addition to hosting the event, the consultant would help staff develop a benefits package to offer sponsors.

Board Member Horvath shared that he was part of the RFP review team and noted several respondents did not follow the directions. Verdical Group not only followed the instructions, but their package of services could help the virtual event be as similar as possible to an in-person event.

Board Member Dieringer asked if it would be possible to approve the agreement at this time but approve the costs at a later time. Ms. Fuentes explained that some of the options offered, particularly involving the sponsor benefits package, are time sensitive and delays could hinder staff's ability to fundraise.

Board Member Horvath added that the amount referenced in the memo is a not-to-exceed amount that would allow staff to select the needed services. There are additional ways to save costs as staff better identifies aspects that could be done in-house as opposed to by the consultant.

Board Member Dieringer cautioned that she was going to approve the recommendation this time but would prefer that full proposals be provided to the Board prior to requesting action. Ms. Bacharach realized that the full proposal was not included in the memo handout and apologized for the oversight.

The handout memo is available here:

[https://www.southbaycities.org/sites/default/files/board\\_directors/meeting/HANDOUT\\_11-19-20%20GA%20Virtual%20Mgt%20Services%20item.pdf](https://www.southbaycities.org/sites/default/files/board_directors/meeting/HANDOUT_11-19-20%20GA%20Virtual%20Mgt%20Services%20item.pdf)

Verdical Group. No objection. So ordered.

**B. Advocacy re: housing legislation**

Ms. Bacharach reported that the SBCCOG will begin organizing meetings with legislators (by district). In addition to South Bay representatives, the SBCCOG should also meet with legislative leaders such as Housing Committee Chairs. Several Board Members (Boyles, Tanaka, Valentine, Armato, Cruikshank, Horvath) volunteered to participate in the meetings with their respective representatives.

**C. South Bay Fiber Network**

Ms. Bacharach reported that the South Bay Fiber Network Working Group met and had over 60 people in attendance. Equinix, one of the two points of presence, presented on their services. Reflecting on the meeting, it appears that the content was too technical, but began to show that by being part of the SBFN, a world of applications become available to cities via the points of presence such as Equinix. Board Member Horvath added that each Board Member should meet with their IT, Public Works, and Community Development Directors to consider ways to take advantage of these options.

Ms. Bacharach also shared that the SBFN Celebration Ceremony took place and was well attended. She took a moment to thank the SBCCOG staff that put together the event.

Board Member Chen shared that he participated and thought it went really well.

**D. Police Operations and Public Safety in the South Bay**

Chair Valentine asked the Board if they had shared the circulated questions with their police chiefs; if the responses were satisfactory; and if the responses were shared with fellow councilmembers.

Board Member Cruikshank shared that he and Councilmember Alegria met with the Captain of their Sheriff's station who provided written responses to the questions. Those responses have not yet been shared with the whole council but will be soon.

Board Member Boyles shared that his city is still working on responses. The police department was in the process of updating its use of force policy. A Committee was established as part of the city's response to protests over the summer, and that Committee will be getting responses to the questions.

Board Member Chen explained that he shared the questions with their police chief who will be meeting with the City Manager in coming weeks. The current police chief is retiring effective January 8<sup>th</sup>, so some of the questions may be used as part of the interview process.

Chair Valentine asked if the Board felt it was a useful exercise. Board Member Horvath shared he felt it was very useful and that there was nothing to lose by going down the path of asking these questions.

#### **E. Local Travel Network**

Ms. Bacharach announced that SBCCOG staff is currently working on a final report that should be completed in January.

#### **F. Senior Services**

Ms. Farwell reported that the Senior Services Working Group will meet December 1<sup>st</sup> and will provide an opportunity for cities to share updates on their efforts to help seniors prepare for the holidays and during the pandemic.

#### **G. Homeless Services**

Ms. Farwell provided the Board an overview on HomeShare South Bay program that launched in October. Staff continues to work with cities to spread the word about the program. The program aims to match those who may have “extra home” with those who may be facing homelessness. The program is being funded through the LA County Homeless Innovation Funds. Staff is currently working with city staff and local organizations to help spread the word about the program and to encourage potential homeowners to participate. Ms. Farwell added that SBCCOG staff is also working on educational modules that will be shared with city staff and will serve as a “myth buster” type of document to help educate city staff on the reality of the homelessness problem. Ms. Farwell added that the outdoor Homeless Count is likely being cancelled in 2021 due to the ongoing pandemic.

Board Member Tanaka asked about Project Homekey. Ms. Farwell explained that two sites in the South Bay, one in Harbor City and one in unincorporated LA County, are being readied for conversion. At this time, it doesn't appear any additional sites will be coming online in the South Bay. PATH will be the service provider for the Harbor City location.

#### **H. Other**

Ms. Bacharach asked city representatives to provide the SBCCOG with a framed photo of a landmark in their city or an image that represents their city as an “office warming” gift to the SBCCOG. The new office space has a large amount of empty wall space available and SBCCOG staff thought it would be fitting to display images representing SBCCOG cities.

### **X. AGENCY REPORTS**

**NOTE: Oral reports are only made to clarify or amplify written attachments. All reports that were submitted or handed out are available online here: <https://www.southbaycities.org/committees/board-directors/board-directors-meeting-67>**

#### **A. SCAG Committees**

1. **SCAG Community, Economic, & Human Development** (Mark Henderson, Drew Boyles, Frank Zerunyan & Mark Waronek)
2. **Transportation** (James Gazeley)

Discussion on the item added to the agenda took place at this point. Ms. Bacharach explained that some SCAG members are currently requesting President Rex Richardson to call a special closed session meeting of the Regional Council to review findings of the RHNA Litigation Study Team.

Gail Shiimoto-Lohr provided public comment on behalf of the City of Mission Viejo. Ms. Shiimoto-Lohr shared that the City of Mission Viejo is requesting that SCAG challenge the State Department of Housing and Community Development's (HCD) RHNA allocations for the 6<sup>th</sup> RHNA cycle. Recent studies issued in 2020 after HCD released the allocations raise questions about the accuracy of the housing unit allocations. Additionally, there are concerns that HCD did not explicitly follow housing statutes in calculating the SCAG regional number. As a result, SCAG President Rex Richardson convened a closed session of the RHNA Litigation Study Team on November 2 to discuss options and the reports raising concerns. At the November 5<sup>th</sup> Regional Council meeting, President Richardson announced that it was the general consensus of the

Study Team was that SCAG not pursue any litigation or other actions against HCD on the allocation number. Several SCAG members raised questions and sought to understand the Study Team's recommendations and requested a special Regional Council meeting to allow the full body an opportunity to discuss. The City of Mission Viejo requests the SBCCOG Board's support in calling for a special closed session of the Regional Council.

Ms. Shiomoto-Lohr's written comments are available online here:

[https://www.southbaycities.org/sites/default/files/board\\_directors/meeting/PUBLIC%20COMMENT%20Memo%20-%20South%20Bay%20Cities%20COG%20Board%20Meeting%20of%2011-19-20%20Supplemental%20Materials.pdf](https://www.southbaycities.org/sites/default/files/board_directors/meeting/PUBLIC%20COMMENT%20Memo%20-%20South%20Bay%20Cities%20COG%20Board%20Meeting%20of%2011-19-20%20Supplemental%20Materials.pdf)

Board Member Horvath added that Redondo Beach has been critical of the methodology and voted last Tuesday to send a letter to SCAG similar to this request.

Board Member Boyles shared that President Richardson had called him earlier in the day but was unable to connect with him. President Richardson shared that several delegates outside of the Orange County area also requesting a closed session.

**MOTION** by Board Member Tanaka, seconded by Board Member Hicks, to **SUBMIT** a letter to SCAG requesting a special closed session meeting of the Regional Council to discuss the RHNA Study Teams findings. No objection. So ordered.

- B. South Bay Workforce Investment Board** (Chris Cagle)
- C. Metro Service Council Report** (Don Szerlip)
- D. Air Quality Management District** (Judy Mitchell, Joe Buscaino & Denny Shaw)
- E. Santa Monica Bay Restoration Commission** (Bill Brand/Kenneth Kao)
- F. Stormwater Funding**
  - 1. CCCA/LCC Stormwater Funding Options Committee (Hany Fangary)
- G. South Bay Aerospace Alliance** (Olivia Valentine/Rodney Tanaka)
- H. California Association of Councils of Governments**

#### **XI. UPCOMING EVENTS & ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Ms. Bacharach announced that November 30<sup>th</sup>-December 6<sup>th</sup> is designated the LA County United Against Hate Week. The LA vs. Hate campaign is spearheading the effort.

#### **XII. ADJOURNMENT**

Chair Valentine adjourned the meeting at 8:34 pm to Thursday, January 28, 2021 at 6:00 pm. The meeting will be held virtually via Zoom until further notice.

David Leger, Assistant Board Secretary

**SOUTH BAY CITIES COUNCIL OF GOVERNMENTS  
MONDAY, NOVEMBER 30, 2020  
HELD VIRTUALLY VIA ZOOM**

**I. CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Valentine called the Special Meeting of the SBCCOG Board of Directors meeting to order at 6:01 pm.

**ATTENDANCE**

**In attendance were the following voting elected officials:**

Cedric Hicks, Carson	Hildy Stern, Manhattan Beach
Drew Boyles, El Segundo	Kenny Kao, Palos Verdes Estates
Rodney Tanaka, Gardena	John Cruikshank, Rancho Palos Verdes
Olivia Valentine, Hawthorne (7:01 departure)	Christian Horvath, Redondo Beach
Stacey Armato, Hermosa Beach	Britt Huff, Rolling Hills Estates
James Butts, Inglewood	George Chen, Torrance
Bernadette Suarez, Lawndale	Janice Hahn, LA County District 4 (6:45 departure)
Jim Gazeley, Lomita	

**Other elected officials in attendance:**

Chris Pimentel, El Segundo	Frank Zerunyan, Rolling Hills Estates
Michael Kemps, Palos Verdes Estates	Pat Furey, Torrance
Eric Alegria, Rancho Palos Verdes	Aurelio Mattucci, Torrance
Bill Brand, Redondo Beach	Sharon Kalani, Torrance
Nils Nehrenheim, Redondo Beach	Mike Griffiths, Torrance
Velveth Schmitz, Rolling Hills Estates	

**Also, in attendance were the following persons:**

Martha Guzman-Hurtado, El Segundo	Anthony Zaller, CA Restaurant Assoc.
Suja Lowenthal, Hermosa Beach	Jacki Bacharach, SBCCOG
Laura Guglielmo, Palos Verdes Estates	Steve Lantz, SBCCOG
Ara Mihranian, Rancho Palos Verdes	David Leger, SBCCOG
Ted Semaan, Redondo Beach	Natalie Champion, SBCCOG
Brandy Forbes, Redondo Beach	Collen Farrell, SBCCOG
Greg Grammer, Rolling Hills Estates	Julie Zaller, Public
Aram Chaparyan, Torrance	Madelyn Alfano, Public
Mike Bohlke, Metro Deputy to Mayor Butts	Selwyn Yosslowitz, Public
Jacqueline Sun, Beach Cities Health District	Janet Young, Public
Tom Bakaly, Beach Cities Health District	John Tallichet, Public
Jeff Kiernan, CalCities	Ivan Vasquez, Public
Heidi Butzine, Lomita Chamber of Commerce	Terri Bloomgarden, Public
David Juarez, CA Restaurant Assoc.	

**II. CONFIRM POSTING OF THE AGENDA**

Jacki Bacharach confirmed that the agenda was properly posted in the City of Hermosa Beach.

Chair Valentine took this time to introduce LA County Supervisor Janice Hahn who joined the meeting to provide a brief update on recent actions taken by LA County.

Supervisor Hahn explained that new safer at home restrictions are being implemented today that will ban indoor and outdoor dining. It appears that too few people have been adhering to social distancing and mask requirements. Indoor gatherings amongst family and friends are the likely source of the current surge in COVID-19. She added that at this point, the discussion on restaurants is wrapped up in this entire discussion and goal to keep people in their homes. Supervisor Hahn went on to explain that she and Supervisor Barger had attempted to overturn the outdoor dining ban via a motion at the Board of Supervisors' meeting, but the motion was defeated. Supervisor Hahn went on to explain that she has not been provided evidence by the Health Department that shows the current surge is due to outdoor dining, and that the current ban will do more economic harm than good towards



reducing the spread of COVID-19.

Board Member Huff asked Supervisor Hahn if there were any efforts to end the “one-size-fits-all” approach to the outdoor dining ban and allow areas with lower numbers, such as the South Bay, to remain open. Supervisor Hahn explained that she and Supervisor Barger appealed to the Governor to allow for a more sub-regional approach in LA County but were flatly rejected by the Governor. She further explained that the Service Planning Areas within the county each have regional health directors, so it would make sense to continue advocating for this type of approach.

Supervisor Hahn went on to say that the current outdoor dining ban is a temporary measure, and that reconsideration will be granted in two weeks. However, due to continually rising hospitalizations statewide, there may be superseding State directives that would prevent outdoor dining even if the County does not extend its ban. Although death rates are lower than at the beginning of the pandemic, this is largely due to medical advances in treating patients as more knowledge is gained. Hospitals are nearing capacity and at this point, avoiding a collapse of the healthcare system is a top priority.

Board Member Horvath added that his wife is an ICU doctor in Torrance. She informed him that ICU beds were full, and the number of ER visits were only increasing. Caseloads have quadrupled week-to-week. Although businesses are suffering, doctors will argue that any space where people are unmasked is a high-risk activity.

Supervisor Hahn thanked the Board of Directors for convening this meeting and expressed her desire to continue working together. She departed the meeting at this point.

### **III. BEACH CITIES HEALTH DISTRICT COVID-19 HEALTH UPDATE FOR THE SOUTH BAY**

Jacqueline Sun presented on the current COVID-19 statistics in the South Bay. She explained that there is a tremendous surge in average daily case numbers, deaths, and hospitalizations throughout the State. Within LA County, there was a 182% increase in daily new cases and 71% increase in deaths between October and November. At the BCHD testing facility, there has been a 33% increase in positive cases. She went on to review slides with more detailed information on South Bay cities.

Tom Bakaly then presented briefly on BCHD’s current efforts to study the opportunity to establish a public health department, that department’s legal responsibilities, and some initial arguments in support and opposition to the idea.

The full presentation is available online here:

[https://www.southbaycities.org/sites/default/files/board\\_directors/meeting/Beach%20Cities%20Health%20District%20Presentation\\_11.30.2020.pdf](https://www.southbaycities.org/sites/default/files/board_directors/meeting/Beach%20Cities%20Health%20District%20Presentation_11.30.2020.pdf)

Councilmember Mattucci asked a question about fighting bad data, referring to an article he read that indicated only 3% of cases were coming from restaurants. Ms. Sun explained that those numbers tend to be employee numbers, as it is easier to determine that an employee may have been exposed while working a shift at the restaurant. It is almost impossible for a patron at a restaurant to say that they were exposed at a specific location. Workplace infections are a much easier metric to accurately track. Mr. Bakaly added that the outdoor dining ban is more about curbing people’s behavior, which is different than dealing with any other disaster we have faced.

Several Board Members discussed the possibility of forming a health department to oversee the South Bay. Mr. Bakaly explained that BCHD is looking into what it would take, but cautioned that it would be a long-term effort, not something that could be done in a week or two that would allow the subregion to remove itself from the LA County outdoor dining ban.

### **IV. UPDATE ON THE OUTDOOR DINING BAN AND WHAT EFFORTS CALIFORNIA RESTAURANT ASSOCIATION IS CURRENTLY TAKING TO SUPPORT RESTAURANTEURS**

David Juarez, Director of Local Government Affairs for the California Restaurant Association provided a brief overview of the impact of the pandemic on restaurants. Before the pandemic, there were approximately 90,000 restaurants and 1.4M restaurant workers in the State. In July, approximately 1M of those workers were employed, and approximately 30% of restaurants were temporarily or permanently closed. Of LA County’s approximately 31,000 restaurants, about 7500 are permanently closed, and another 7500 are temporarily closed. The balance are operating in a modified capacity. He cautioned that without further stimulus, these numbers will get worse.

Anthony Zaller, a lawyer and recently elected Chair of the Board of Directors for the California Restaurant Association Foundation, also shared that legal action has been taken against the LA County outdoor dining ban, asserting that the decision was arbitrary and not data driven. Mr. Zaller elaborated on the strain restaurants face, such as expenses to build outdoor dining facilities, permit fees, and more.

Ms. Madelyn Alfano thanked the SBCCOG Board for inviting restaurants. She shared that one other aspect of the situation is the issue of landlord relief. She explained that many restaurants have signed leases that include personal guarantees that would allow a landlord to pursue legal action against the individual in an attempt to collect rent. Without relief for landlords or legislative protection from these personal guarantees, many restauranters may never be able to financially recover.

## **V. PUBLIC COMMENT**

No additional public comment was received.

## **VI. BOARD DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION**

Vice-Chair Boyles called for discussion after hearing the presentations.

Board Member Butts shared that he believes the South Bay should continue to evaluate local health departments.

Board Member Horvath added that similar to how the County has been dealing with the homeless service areas, perhaps using the Service Planning Areas to localize health department decisions could be an avenue for further evaluation. He also shared that the State is projecting a \$20B+ underestimation in tax revenue, so perhaps some of those surplus funds could be used to save restaurants via grant programs. Mr. Kiernan shared that the State authorized \$500M in additional grants for small businesses earlier today.

Mayor Furey shared that a few months ago, the idea of creating a South Bay health department was proposed at the Steering Committee, the idea was not supported at the time. Given the changing situation, perhaps further study of this idea, perhaps along the Service Planning Area as mentioned by Board Member Horvath is the proper long-term approach. However, it does not appear that this would be a near-term possibility. He added that lobbying incoming Supervisor Holly Mitchell to overturn the outdoor dining ban could be a short-term victory.

Board Member Kao added that getting the support of BCHD on SBCCOG efforts could carry weight.

Councilmember Pimentel suggested looking into the possibility of joining Long Beach or Pasadena Health Departments as a short-term solution.

Board Member Butts proposed the SBCCOG move forward with all ideas discussed during the meeting. He went on to specify his motion as follows:

**MOTION** by Board Member Butts, seconded by Board Member Hicks, to: 1) Further explore a South Bay Health Department, and if possible, accelerated to focus on retail/restaurants; 2) Continue advocating for additional funding to assist restaurants; 3) Send a letter to the LA County Board of Supervisors urging them to allow outdoor dining and/or consider an exemption for the South Bay; 4) Lobby Supervisor-Elect Mitchell to support overturning the outdoor dining ban; 5) Explore the possibility of joining the Pasadena or Long Beach Health Departments; 6) Seek Beach Cities Health District support. No objection. So ordered.

The following SBCCOG members were not present for the vote: City of Hawthorne; City of Los Angeles; City of Rolling Hills; LA County District 2; LA County District 4.

For more detail, the full meeting has been uploaded and is available for viewing here:

<https://youtu.be/MhGKLwSEbOw>

## **VII. ADJOURNMENT**

Vice-Chair Boyles adjourned the meeting at 8:08 pm to Thursday, January 28, 2021 at 6:00 pm. The meeting will be held virtually via Zoom until further notice.

David Leger, Assistant Board Secretary